

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

**Minutes of Dalgety Bay Forum Meeting
Held on Monday 11th June 2012 at 2.00pm
at the Brook North Queensferry Hotel**

Present

Nick Atkins (NA), Morton Fraser (accompanying MOD(DIO))
David Brack (DB) MOD(DIO)
Gareth Brown (GB) Scottish Government (for JC)
Ron Brown (RB), MOD/DSTL
John Burton (JB), HPA
Helen Eadie MSP (HE), Member of Scottish Parliament
Mark Hill, (MH) MOD(DIO)
Larry Irwin (LI), Moray Estates
Martin Macdonald (MMac), Scottish Government
Colin McPhail (CMcPh), Dalgety Bay & Hillend
Community Council (DB&HCC)
Will Munro (WM), FSA in Scotland
Iain Robertson (IR), MOD(DIO)
Linda Turner (LT), Fife Council
Janice Milne (JM), Chairperson, SEPA
Jim Gemmill (JG), SEPA
Paul Dale (PD), SEPA
Gillian Sinclair (GS), SEPA
Debbie Storm (DS Comms), SEPA
Mark Toner (MT) SEPA

Apologies

David Burnett (DBur), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club
Edward Coyle (EC), NHS Fife
Jackie Hyland (JH), NHS Fife
Arthur Johnston (AJ), Scottish Government
Jacqueline Campbell (JC), Scottish
Government
Ewan Young (EW) Scottish Government
Cllr Alice McGarry (AM), Fife Councillor
Donald Adrain (DA), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club
Donald Grant (DG), Fife Council
Richard Higgins (RH), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club

Summary of actions from meeting - 11th June 2012		
Action 2012-06-01	<i>JM asked all Forum members to email any comments on the minutes of 27th March 2012 to Gillian Sinclair by Monday 25th June 2012.</i>	Forum Members
Action 2012-06-02	<i>Action on DIO/FSA/Fife Council: It was agreed that DIO and Fife Council and FSA would need to liaise regarding location of signage at Dalgety Bay to ensure that there was no delay in erection of signage. (Ref: Page 4, Para 3.5.3).</i>	DIO/FSA/Fife Council
Action 2012-06-03	<i>The next Dalgety Bay Forum meeting will take place on 10th September 2012 at a location yet to be informed. Arrangements will be made by SEPA</i>	SEPA

1.0	Welcome and Apologies	Actions
1.0.1	JM welcomed those present to the meeting.	
1.0.2	Apologies were received from Cllr Alice McGarry, Ewan Young and Donald Adrain.	
2.0	Minutes of previous meeting (27 March 2012)	
2.0.1 Action 2012-06-01	Action No 2012-06-01 JM asked all Forum members to email any comments on the minutes of 27 th March 2012 to Gillian Sinclair by Monday 18 th June 2012.	Forum Members

	Actions arising from meeting held on 27th March 2012	
ACTION 2012-30-01	ACTION – DIO & SEPA to ensure aerial photographs records are complete. (Reference:- Page 2, Paragraph 3.1.6 of previous minute)	DIO Ongoing
	DIO and SEPA to liaise regarding aerial photographs and ensure information on these are passed to each other. Note: SEPA has previously provided details of photographs held,	SEPA

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

	however for avoidance of doubt a paper copy of the details and thumbnail images of SEPA's aerial photographs was passed to Nick Atkins during the meeting. Details of the images held by MoD are detailed in the draft information review.	Complete
ACTION 2012-03-02	ACTION – DIO Stage 1 Initial Site Conceptual Model to be completed by end of May 2012 (Reference:- Page 3, Para 3.2.2 of previous minute) * All information to be provided to SEPA	DIO Ongoing
ACTION 2012-03-03	ACTION - DIO Stage 2 – Investigate pollutant linkages being carried out between May and October 2012. (Reference:- Page 3, Para 3.2.4 of previous minute). * All information to be provided to SEPA	DIO Ongoing
ACTION 2012-03-04	ACTION – DIO Stage 3 – Following Stage 2, compile findings and identify risks. (Reference:- Page 3, Para 3.2.5 of previous minute) * All information to be provided to SEPA	DIO Ongoing
ACTION 2012-03-05	ACTION: RH/Dalgety Bay Sailing Club (DBSC) to capture and forward any questions to PD and he will be happy to assist in keeping members informed. (Reference:- Page 5, Paragraph 3.3.3 of previous minute)	DBSC Ongoing
	<i>As DBSC were unable to attend today's meeting, SEPA (PD) will liaise with the Sailing Club to ensure they have the information they require on risk management.</i>	
ACTION 2012-03-06	ACTION – SEPA to create list of key dates, to include forum meetings, community council meetings, Sailing Club events, and DIO investigation stages, SEPA reports. (Reference:- Page 8, Paragraph 4.7 of previous minute)	SEPA Ongoing To be completed by 25 June 2012
	<i>JM advised that the next Forum Meeting will tie in with DB&HCC meetings and will be on 10th September 2012, location to be advised.</i> <i>SEPA will produce a list of key dates in accordance with the list in action 2012-03-06 which can be updated as and when required.</i>	
Action 2012-03-07	ACTION - SEPA to arrange the next Dalgety Bay Forum Meeting. (Reference:- Page 9, Para 6.0.2 of previous minute)	SEPA Complete
3.0	Update from Forum Members	
3.1	SEPA	
3.1.1	PD advised that SEPA is continuing in its role as regulator and providing input to DIO's contractor reports when available and as necessary. SEPA's monitoring work continued with an attempt at using larger detectors and other novel technology to trial the effectiveness of these systems and is now awaiting formal reports from this work.	
3.1.2	The output of this work will be reviewed, to determine if it can assist the investigation plan and shared with all parties via the Expert Group (Dalgety Bay Particle Advisory Group (DBPAG)).	
3.1.3	SEPA's experimental work continues, with the next report due for release in the next 2-3 weeks. Following this a third report will be produced on ingestion doses.	
3.1.4	Further check monitoring on the beach by SEPA was undertaken, and the results have been fed back to DIO.	
3.1.5	SEPA revisited the 'new harbour' area at the request of COMARE (Committee on Medical Aspects of Radiation in the Environment) and identified and recovered particles. SEPA has requested that this area be	

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

<p>3.1.6</p> <p>3.1.7</p>	<p>adopted in the monthly monitoring programme. DIO will consider this request as part of the monitoring optimisation works.</p> <p>GB asked when the reports will be issued and if they will be made public. PD advised that this should take 4 months pending availability of resources. HE questioned the resources issues. PD advised that it is priority of resources i.e. where people need to be protected / monitoring the beach / lab work these would be prioritised over production of documents.</p> <p><u>Particle Find</u> PD stated that during SEPA's check monitoring programme in April a further high activity source was found in front of the headland which had an activity of 2.1MBq. This was also detected by Amec (DIO's contractor). As a result of the find SEPA has provided clarification on what is required and Amec's monitoring protocol has been amended accordingly.</p>	
<p>3.2</p>	<p>DIO</p>	
<p>3.2.1</p> <p>3.2.2</p> <p>3.2.3</p> <p>3.2.4</p> <p>3.2.5</p> <p>3.2.6</p>	<p>Following the request of the sailing club, the on-site cabin containing radium sources recovered by Amec has been removed.</p> <p>Note: sources removed have now been disposed to a suitably licensed landfill facility.</p> <p>Conceptual Site model has progressed. DIO is also looking at the conceptual exposure model with the intention of this being presented to the Expert Group. WM asked if the food chain was considered within the exposure model. DB noted that this would be via ingestion, and discussed with SEPA. DB suggested that the model is shared with FSA once the first draft is complete.</p> <p>DIO continue to liaise with SEPA on the best areas to monitor.</p> <p>HE enquired about the area where the new sources were found. DB believed that this area is already been monitored.</p> <p>CMcP asked if DIO were continuing to investigate the land ownership aspects at Dalgety Bay. NA advised that he is liaising with SEPA on the necessary issues, which includes land ownership in order to assist SEPA in identifying the potential appropriate person or persons. PD added that formal identification of the appropriate person would be necessary if the land were designated as RCL.</p>	
<p>3.3</p>	<p>Scottish Government Update</p>	
<p>3.3.1</p> <p>3.3.2</p> <p>3.3.3</p> <p>3.3.4</p>	<p>MM stated that the Scottish Government welcomed the investigation plan.</p> <p>MM reported that Mr Richard Lochhead, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and Environment continues to liaise with The Right Honourable Andrew Robathan, Minister for Defence Personnel, Welfare and Veterans on the matter.</p> <p>HE stated that she had written to the First Minister and to-date has not has an acknowledgement. MM agreed to look into this matter.</p> <p>HE also stated that she had raised the matter of Dalgety Bay at First</p>	

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

3.3.5	Ministers Question Time; however, the matter was not regarded as high importance. GB stated that from a health perspective he had nothing to update.	
3.4	FSA	
3.4.1	WM stated that the FSA introduced a Food and Environment Protection Order (FEPA) on 9 th May 2012. This will provide protection to the public from any potential risk in the food chain due to the presence of radioactive particles at Dalgety Bay. This will be reviewed after a year, however it can be reviewed at any time in light of any new evidence. The FEPA area is larger than the survey area and sampling results will be reported. IR asked that a copy be sent to him. Fife Council will be responsible for enforcing the Order, with around 30 officers trained for this role.	
3.4.2	Shellfish sampling continues. Signage is to be erected shortly.	
3.5	Fife Council	
3.5.1	LT advised that officers have been authorised to take action at Dalgety Bay as a result of the FEPA order.	
3.5.2	Locations for signs have been agreed and WM has been asked to confirm his approval for this in writing. These will be installed following a risk assessment.	
3.5.3 Action 2012-06-02	IR asked if he could be informed of the location of the signs as DIO signs are being relocated in order to cover areas deemed not to be covered at present. It was agreed that DIO and Fife Council and FSA would need to liaise regarding location of signage at Dalgety Bay to ensure that there was no delay in erection of signage. In addition LT would contact Shell UK regarding location of signage.	DIO/FSA/Fife Council
3.6	HPA	
3.6.1	JB provided an update from HPA. HPA has been assisting Fife Council with Radiological Protection Issues in relation to staff seizing shellfish catches under the FEPA order.	
3.6.2	HPA maintain an observer role at the DBPAG, (also known as the Expert Group).	
3.7	NHS Fife	
3.7.1	No representatives from NHS Fife were present at the meeting.	
3.8	Dalgety Bay Sailing Club	
3.8.1	No representatives from Dalgety Bay Sailing Club were present.	
3.9	Dalgety Bay and Hillend Community Council	
3.9.1	CMcPh advised that on 27 th March 2012 a public meeting was held at which PD attended to answer questions from the public.	
3.9.2	CMcPh advised that he was pleased with the progress to date.	
3.9.3	He has carried out some land ownership research and continued to write to Mr Olney, DIO. He stated that it is important that there is a moral responsibility. NA stated that moral responsibility is not a legal issue and that it is SEPA's role to identify those responsible.	

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

<p>3.9.4</p> <p>3.9.5</p> <p>3.9.6</p>	<p>MH advised that Mr Olney has now left DIO and Mr Mark Hutchinson has now taken over as Chief Operating Officer for DIO.</p> <p>CMcPh stated that an e-petition directed at the UK Government has been set up on the DB&HCC website inviting people to sign. The campaign message states: "I respectfully ask the Ministry of Defence and Scottish Environment Protection Agency to state that remedial work on the contaminated foreshore area in Dalgety Bay will begin immediately after the investigation plan is satisfactorily completed and that those deemed responsible for the contamination will fund the work and have it completed by the end of 2013".</p> <p>DIO questioned why the petition was directed at the UK Government as environmental protection was a devolved matter.</p> <p>HE stated that she supported the petition and suggested that it also goes to the Scottish Parliament.</p>	
<p>3.10</p>	<p>Moray Estates</p>	
<p>3.10.1</p> <p>3.10.2</p> <p>3.10.3</p> <p>3.10.4</p> <p>3.10.5</p>	<p>LI stated that he continues to look through records and will ensure information is passed on, if any of relevance is found.</p> <p>He asked if there were any parallels between Dalgety Bay and press reports on Kinloss. DB stated that Dalgety Bay cannot be compared to Kinloss as the land quality of RAF Kinloss has already been assessed. JG noted that Land Quality Assessments were available for Kinloss.</p> <p>LI said that his enquiry was only to ensure that if there was any expertise to be drawn from Kinloss it could be used upon at Dalgety Bay.</p> <p>NA asked if any relevant information becomes available from Moray Estates could it also be passed to him as well as SEPA. It was agreed that any information and documents relating to land ownership which became available from Moray Estates would also be sent to DIO.</p> <p>IR noted that DIO would need to apply for consents to undertake work on the beach areas. IR requested a clear map of what was owned and by whom.</p>	
<p>4.0</p>	<p>Future Actions</p>	
<p>4.0.1</p> <p>4.0.2</p> <p>4.0.3</p> <p>4.0.4</p>	<p>SEPA The Expert Group (DBPAG) will be provided with the CSM and exposure and investigation strategy at the next meeting on 19th July 2012. The exposure model will then decide on whether any changes to the proposed locations for trial pits etc should be amended.</p> <p>DIO Engagement with the local community and stakeholders who will be affected, DIO plans to explain the excavation and survey areas in advance of the works. This will fit in with the Expert Group timescales, as intrusive work will be shifted 2-3 weeks to allow consultation with DBPAG (Expert Group).</p> <p>CMcPh asked about DIO about their community engagement proposal and insisted that the whole community should be informed.</p> <p>Previously DIO has provided statements to CMcPh to pass on at</p>	

SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

<p>4.0.5</p> <p>4.0.6</p>	<p>Community Council Meetings and it was agreed this would continue as well as ensuring that the “The Diary” (a local publication) be updated for which information should be passed to the editor by the 15th of the month.</p> <p>MH stated that in the past road shows have been held in order that the public can visit and be updated with relevant information and facts. CMcPh said that this would be agreeable and he would be happy to assist DIO with arrangements additionally he suggested that this could be held locally in the Church hall or a side room to this. MH explained that such road shows are useful in lessening the anxiety of the community and providing a forum for feedback on what is proposed.</p> <p>CMcPh also added that the Sailing Club calendar of events was available on their webpage in order for DIO to schedule their work. It was indicated that the sailing club had a full season of events up until October.</p>	
<p>5.0</p>	<p>SEPA Press Statement</p>	
<p>5.0.1</p>	<p>DS Comms advised the Forum that SEPA will be issuing a press release following the meeting to journalists that had previously requested an update. She read this to those present. HE asked if this could be adjusted in order that a layperson could more easily comprehend, which was agreed.</p>	
<p>6.0</p>	<p>Next Meeting</p>	
<p>6.0.1 Action 2012-06-03</p>	<p>The next Dalgety Bay Forum meeting will take place on 10th September 2012 at a location yet to be informed.</p>	<p>SEPA</p>