

PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY)

SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION and RECORD OF RECOMMENDATIONS and ACTIONS

3rd MEETING OF THE PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY) – 17th February 2010

Present:

Prof Keith Boddy (Chair) - **KB**
 Prof Alex Elliott (Member) – **AE** (Also Observer for COMARE)
 Prof Marian Scott (Member) - **MS**
 Dr Andrew Tyler (Member) – **AT**
 Dr Paul Dale (Technical Secretary) - **Tec Sec**

In Attendance:

Ms Joanne Brown (Observer, HPA) - **JB**
 Mr Phil Cartwright (Observer, DSRL) - **PC**
 Mr Hugh Fearn (Observer, SEPA) - **HF**
 Mr Trevor Jones (Observer, NDA; alternate for Mr Randall Bargelt) - **TJ**
 Mr Richard Lennon (SEPA) - **RL**
 Dr Will Munro (Observer, FSA) - **WM**
 Mr Bill Thomson (Observer, DSRL) - **BillT**
 Mr Byron Tilly (Observer, SEPA) – **BT**
 Mrs June Moore (Administration) – **JM**

Apologies:

Prof Tim Atkinson (Member) – **TA**
 Mr Stuart Hudson (Observer, The Scottish Government) - **SH**
 Mr Alastair MacDonald (Observer, DSG) – **AMacD**

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
1 Chairman's Introduction	<p>Chairman welcomed all present to the 3rd PRAG(D) meeting. He noted that apologies had been received from TA, SH and AMacD.</p> <p>KB outlined the priority for the 3rd meeting, to comprise a brief update from DSRL, consideration of the future retrieval work programme and, most importantly, to finalise the draft of the Group's Annual Report to SEPA.</p>		Draft Annual Report to be agreed during today's meeting: All	Open	Close of this meeting

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
2 Minutes <i>Paper 001</i>	KB asked Members to consider Paper M3/001.				
2.1 Record of Previous Meeting	The Summary of Discussion and Record of Recommendations and Actions from the meeting held on 18 th November was accepted, with minor amendment.		Record of the 2 nd meeting of PRAG(D) to be posted on SEPA's website. (JM)	Open	
2.2 Actions Arising	The Tec Sec led the Group through the actions arising from the previous two meetings. Action points were considered and were closed, superseded or carried forward, as agreed.		Actions carried forward from previous meetings to be recorded as an appendix to this document (Tec Sec & JM).	Open	
3 Offshore Retrieval Work	Chairman invited comments from PC on the updated reports.				
3.1 Offshore Work Undertaken 2008 <i>Papers 002 & 003</i>	<p>PC outlined the recent amendments to the report, following discussion at the PRAG(D) November meeting, and gave a brief summary of the conclusions in this version. It was noted that a total of 55 particles were recovered remotely from the main plume surveyed ~ 14,100 m². The Group discussed the content and implications of the report at length. It was noted that the area covered during last year had been chosen to validate the model.</p> <p>PC drew the Group's attention to the amendments in Paper 003 and the maps were considered. Queries were raised and addressed. PC confirmed that the numbers on documents referred to the depth at which the particles were buried.</p>	<p>It was noted that it had been agreed that future detection and retrieval work would be targeted to a depth and area where it was believed that a higher number of potentially <i>significant</i> particles might be located.</p> <p>It was suggested that further clarification to the legends on the maps would be helpful.</p>	<p>DSRL to continue to detect and retrieve as many (high activity) particles as possible.</p> <p>During the next year's work, it is DSRL's intention to go back over some of the area covered in 2008, to establish whether there has been any re-population of particles.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
3.2 Offshore Work Undertaken 2009 <i>Papers 003, 004, & 005</i>	PC outlined the modifications to the report following presentation to PRAG(D) and gave a brief summary of the conclusions in this version, Paper M3/004. It was noted that, during 2009, the total survey area coverage of 92,657 m ² had resulted in the retrieval of 115 particles. The summaries in Paper M3/005 were considered.				
3.3 Implications <i>Tabled Papers 011 and 012</i>	PC said that the evidence of high activity particle movement was not conclusive, rather 'suggestive', and this needs further testing in subsequent recovery programmes. Late papers were accepted and tabled as PRAG(D)/2010/M3/011(T) and /012(T).	KB recommended that, at its next meeting, the Group look at the report produced by the Monitoring Sub-Group.	DSRL to carry out further work to determine the possibility of higher activity particles migrating toward Sandside. Following consideration of tabled Papers 011 and 012, the Monitoring Sub-Group was tasked to provide further assessment of possible consequences of the offshore recovery work on the rate of particle arrival at Dounreay and Sandside beaches. AE, MS & AT	Open Open	 June meeting
4 Preparation of Group's Report to SEPA <i>Paper 006 and Tabled Paper 012</i>	The draft report Paper M3/006 was displayed on-screen, for consideration and immediate modification and amendment, as agreed during the Group's discussions. KB spoke to the Paper and said the Annual Report would be considered in conjunction with Paper M3/012(T), provided by the Monitoring Sub-Group. Sections from the Monitoring Sub-Group's Paper could be extracted for insertion into the draft Annual Report, as the Members deemed appropriate.	The Group considered the content of the Report at length and agreed various amendments to the text.	The content of the Report was amended 'live' during the meeting. It was agreed that the Tec Sec would circulate the revised draft version produced during today's meeting, for the Members' further consideration. Tec Sec and Members only.	Live edit Open	 Within 2 weeks Report to be issued to SEPA by end March 2010

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
5 Surveys Update – Beaches	The Chairman invited DSRL to provide information on beach monitoring. BillT led the Group through a presentation on DSRL beach surveys.				
5.1 Sandside <i>Paper 007</i>	<p>BillT presented the results of monitoring during November and December 2009 and confirmed that access was withdrawn following the December survey.</p> <p>Arrangements for future monitoring were discussed. PC advised the meeting that information has been passed to the UK Government and he is optimistic that the relevant parties are close to obtaining agreement with the Sandside Estate to permit uninterrupted monitoring. If the terms could be agreed, it would be feasible for a continuous period of monitoring to commence in March or early April which could last until, at least, the end of December.</p>	The Group noted that there was no guarantee of agreement to enable continuous beach monitoring and recognised that the current situation was similar to that reached last July. The Group also noted that it was a matter for the Minister and NDA to agree terms with the Estate's owner(s).			
5.2 Dounreay Foreshore <i>Papers 008 & 009</i>	<p>The survey results were considered and discussed. During the presentation and ensuing discussion, the Group considered Paper M3/008; advice to Members of the Public. BillT informed Members that the most recent legal advice to DSRL was that they could not restrict access to the Foreshore.</p> <p>PD asked if, given that the NDA competition for operating the Dounreay site will begin shortly, the tendering process has the potential to affect the contracts for monitoring or recovery work associated with particles. PC stated that the intention is that arrangements are</p>	During discussion, it was noted that the proposed signage was awaiting SEPA's consideration.	BT agreed to obtain SEPA's view on the proposed signage.	Open	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
5.2 /cont	controlled by DSRL, rather than the Site Licensed Company.				
5.3 Dunnet	It was noted that the SEPA habits survey of Dunnet Beach had been completed and SEPA was awaiting a report from its contractor.				
5.4 Others	<p>The Group discussed the plan for future monitoring. DSRL advised that once monitoring is resumed it plans to complete the footprint, plus an additional area of the beach. PC stated that during the June survey, 3 particles were found in areas that had just been monitored. He informed the Group that DSRL intends to increase the area of monitoring with an overlap from month to month, so as to provide additional information and add another variable for consideration.</p> <p>It was noted that, following a protracted tendering exercise, DSRL has awarded the contract for the 2010 offshore remediation programme to a different contractor from that previously used. A new system will be used for the retrieval work, with an emphasis on the capability to retrieve a larger number of particles at the time of detection. The new equipment has a much larger tank to accommodate this.</p> <p>The Group was informed of the capabilities of the new detector system, together with details of the contractual technological remit. TJ advised the Group that the NDA had a very difficult decision in awarding a contract using un-</p>	<p>The Chairman noted his concern that, if the system proves to be inadequate for the task, the Group will have a year without a complete set of required data.</p> <p>It was agreed that the change to a new system of detection and retrieval during the 2010 season should be noted in the Annual Report.</p>	PD agreed to add an appropriate rider to the Report.	Open	To meet Report deadline

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
5.4 /cont	proven methodology, but the new contractor is undertaking the risk to meet the criteria specified in the contract				
6 Review of Dounreay Monitoring Regarding Contaminated Land Regulations	BT invited HF to address this issue. HF informed the meeting that SEPA is awaiting additional calculations, to be provided by HPA, before it can progress the assessment under SG.	PD noted that this has important implications for SEPA regarding the consideration of an end point.			
7 Future Work Programme <i>Paper 010</i>	<p>The preferred area to be covered this year was discussed and considered. The advice of the Group was that the detection and retrieval work needs to be focussed on the areas of highest density of particles.</p> <p>DSRL gave a brief presentation describing the construction of the Diffuser and informed the Group that fresh water appeared to go into the Diffuser and out of the risers into the seabed. PC outlined DSRL's intention to isolate and seal the Diffuser and advised the Group that DSRL provided SEPA with a report on these plans before Christmas 2009. PC said that DSRL wishes to undertake the work to seal the Diffuser as soon as possible.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the target areas should be those identified by DPAG as potentially containing the highest density of particles, to meet the remediation strategy and achieve the maximum reduction in caches of offshore particles.</p> <p>The Chairman noted that, as far as this Group is concerned, if SEPA thinks that it would be useful for the procedure to be considered by PRAG(D), then the Group needs to have this report.</p> <p>It was agreed that this item will be considered at the next PRAG(D) meeting. It was also agreed that, to fully consider the issue in detail, it may be advisable to invite Professor Tony Harris to participate in PRAG(D)'s deliberations on this matter,</p>	<p>SEPA to consider providing PRAG(D) with a copy of DSRL's report on the proposed method for sealing the Diffuser.</p>	Open	Prior to June meeting

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
7 /cont	<p>The Chairman stated that, for the next meeting, the Group would like the views of the Observers on what their considered end point would be for monitoring Sandside, etc., in order to develop an objective on this issue.</p> <p>It was suggested that PRAG(D) look at the work of the Monitoring Sub-Group summary as a potential supplement to the Annual Report.</p> <p>Prof Boddy said that, regarding the Diffuser, he would take the decision on whether to ask Prof Harris, or perhaps another expert in this field, to join the Group for this item.</p>	in view of his previous contributions and knowledge of the Diffuser during his membership of DPAG.	Observers to provide views on a suggested end point for beach monitoring. (From NDA, SEPA, HPA and FSA.)	Open	End of May
			Tec Sec to consider whether it would be appropriate to add the Monitoring Sub-Group summary as a supplement to the Annual Report	Open	End of March
		The Group agreed that it may be advisable to have additional expertise for its deliberations on this matter.	PRAG(D) Chair to consider inviting Prof Harris (or other suitable expert) to join the June meeting, if it is deemed appropriate to obtain additional expertise to assist the existing membership of the Group during its consideration of this item (only). KB	Open	ASAP – in advance of June mtg.
8 Future Meetings	<p>The Group considered the dates previously proposed for a further two meetings during 2010; 23rd June and 27th October.</p> <p>It was suggested that DSRL confirm the launch date for the 2010 work.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the next meeting would be held on the 23 June.</p> <p>It was noted that, due to timing issues relating to the availability of offshore recovery data, the Group would look again at the</p>	JM confirmed that the June meeting will be held at the Carlton Hotel, Edinburgh.	Open	Papers required by 2/6/10 Meeting packs to be issued on 9/6/10

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation/Agreed	Action	Status	Target Date
8 /cont		timetable for the October meeting.			
9 Chairman's Summary	The Chairman thanked the Members and Observers for their contributions to today's meeting. He said that he was including the Observers in his acknowledgements because they have a significant role to fulfil within the Group and he considered it important to encourage an exchange of information between the Members and Observers.				
10 AOB	<p>The Chairman invited any other items of relevant business.</p> <p>BT raised a matter regarding the agreed process to be followed in respect of circulation of PRAG(D)'s Annual Report to the Observers.</p> <p>There being no further business, the Chairman thanked those present for their attendance and closed the meeting.</p>	The Group agreed that the Observers should have access to the final Report. The Chairman said that it is SEPA's decision on how far it wishes to disseminate PRAG(D)'s Annual Report. It was agreed that the Report will be published on the SEPA website.	Tec Sec and JM will arrange for publication of PRAG(D)'s Annual Report on the SEPA website on 1 st April 2010.	Open	By 1/4/10

Acronyms:

DSG	Dounreay Stakeholders Group
DSRL	Dounreay Site Restoration Limited
FSA	Food Standards Agency (Scotland)
HPA	Health Protection Agency
NDA	Nuclear Decommissioning Authority
PRAG(D)	Particles Retrieval Advisory Group (Dounreay)
RCLR	Radioactive Contaminated Land Regulations
SG	(The) Scottish Government
SEPA	Scottish Environment Protection Agency