

PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY)

SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION and RECORD OF RECOMMENDATIONS and ACTIONS

6th MEETING OF THE PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY) – 23rd February 2011

Members Present:

Prof Alex Elliott (Member) – **AE (Acting Chairman)**
 Prof Tim Atkinson (Member) - **TA**
 Prof Marian Scott (Member) - **MS**
 Dr Paul Dale (Technical Secretary) - **PD**

In Attendance:

Ms Joanne Brown (Observer, HPA) - **JB**
 Ms Linda Buchan (Observer (nominated alternate), SEPA) - **LB**
 Mr Phil Cartwright (Observer, DSRL) - **PC**
 Mr Stuart Chalmers (Observer (nominated alternate), NDA) - **SC**
 Mr Jim Gemmill (Observer, SEPA) - **JG**
 Mr Bill Thomson (Observer, DSRL) - **BT**
 Mr Mark Toner (Observer, SEPA) - **MT**
 Mrs June Moore (Administration) - **JM**

Apologies:

Dr Andrew Tyler (Member) - **AT**
 Mr Stuart Hudson (Observer, SG) - **SH**
 Observer, DSG

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
1 Acting Chairman's Introduction	<p>The Acting Chairman welcomed all present to the 6th PRAG meeting.</p> <p>AE advised the meeting that the agenda for today's meeting had been constructed around the primary driver to produce the Group's annual report to SEPA and DSRL. He informed the Group that Mark Toner, from SEPA, would assist with incorporating the agreed amendments or additions to the draft text during the meeting.</p>	<p>The Acting Chairman noted and accepted apologies from Andrew Tyler and the SG.</p> <p>AE also welcomed two nominated alternates to the meeting; Linda Buchan (for SEPA) and Stuart Chalmers (for the NDA). Around the table introductions were made to the new attendees.</p>			

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
1 Acting Chairman's Introduction (continued)	<p>Professor Elliott proposed that, if time did not allow for consideration of the Minute and Outstanding Actions emanating from the last meeting, these documents could be considered by circulation, outwith this meeting.</p> <p>The Acting Chairman also suggested that, as the Members' current contracts would expire at the end of April, JG may choose to say something regarding the continuation of the Group's work and the potential requirement for future meetings. This would be addressed under item 7.</p>				
2 Review of Dounreay Monitoring Regarding Contaminated Land Regulations	<p>PD advised the Group that SEPA has prioritised another site for assessment under RCL and a formal assessment is underway.</p> <p>PD stated that some time ago SEPA requested information from the HPA on the activity which particles recovered from Dounreay would need to contain to deliver the various doses indicated in the guidance issued to SEPA for radioactive contaminated land (in Scotland). PD said that SEPA had now received the final draft of that advice and indicated that it was in-line with SEPA expectations. He noted that the advice stated that, in regards of exposures to the skin <i>"for radiation protection purposes, doses to skin will continue to be calculated as an average over 1 cm² at a depth of 70 µm. In the determination</i></p>			Open	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
2 Review of Dounreay Monitoring Regarding Contaminated Land Regulations (continued)	<p><i>of risk to individuals</i>", which PD indicated was the matter of concern for discrete point sources where the individual dose was of consideration that <i>"it may be appropriate to consider the effect of variations in skin thickness and uncertainties regarding the location of sensitive cells"</i>. PD then continued to explain that, for Dounreay this, in practice, was of little consequence, as the variation in the characteristics of the particles was greater than the effect of consideration of skin thickness, although it would be addressed if SEPA needed to undertake a RCL assessment. PD also noted that there was no need for such an assessment at present as SEPA considered that sufficient management arrangements were already in place. However, the effect on skin for individuals exposed to point sources which had significant alpha component would need detailed consideration.</p> <p>PD confirmed that the review at Dounreay is in abeyance because another site has taken priority and the other site will allow SEPA to establish the necessary due process. He stated that there are already significant management arrangements in place in Dounreay to mitigate the contamination there, this being the important difference with regard to the other site, where it is not [yet] in place.</p> <p>The Acting Chairman stated that this</p>				

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
2 Review of Dounreay Monitoring Regarding Contaminated Land Regulations (continued)	<p>Group can remove RCLR considerations from its agenda for the moment and keep a watching brief on the issue.</p> <p>PC asked whether the same applies to the habit survey at Dunnet. PD advised that this work is largely complete and he is awaiting the final version from the contractor. Once that is provided, a public version of the habits survey will be published on the SEPA website. He added that the final report is expected imminently.</p>				
3 Surveys Update – Beaches 3.1 Sandside Beach 3.2 Dounreay Foreshore 3.3 Dunnet Beach 3.4 Other Beaches	<p>The Acting Chair invited DSRL to provide information on recent onshore surveys.</p> <p>BT gave a presentation on the onshore monitoring operations up to the end of last year and confirmed the number and location of particles detected and retrieved on Sandside beach during the period covering the month of May, then from August to December 2010.</p> <p>This was followed by a report on the survey results for the Dounreay foreshore and, finally, for all other beaches.</p> <p>DSRL concluded the presentation by raising the matter of “Future Requirements”, seeking the Group’s recommendations relating to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completion Criteria 	<p>It was agreed that the Members would consider the data now to hand and, time permitting, would incorporate comparisons with past profiles and other analyses into the annual report. To this end, it was requested that further information be provided by DSRL as soon as possible. The provision of additional data was discussed and suggestions offered.</p> <p>It was agreed that recommendations regarding future monitoring requirements and the suggested appropriate level of remediation would be addressed</p>	<p>It was agreed that DSRL would provide such additional data that could be processed within the timescale.</p> <p>DSRL</p> <p>A copy of the statement by SEPA’s North Region Board pertaining to the issue of “returning the seabed to a pristine condition” was requested.</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p> <p>ASAP</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
3 Surveys Update – Beaches <i>(continued)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reduction in Surveys/Frequency/Coverage Timescales 	<p>within the annual report.</p> <p>It was noted that a new section entitled “Implications of the Forward Work Programme” would be added to the draft report.</p>	<p>Tec Sec/AE/TA</p> <p>The agreed amendment and requirement for additional text was recorded during live-edit of the draft report. AE/TA</p>	Open	During this meeting
4 Preparation of Group’s Report to SEPA	<p>The Acting Chairman asked the Members to consider the draft text for the PRAG(D) annual report to SEPA and DSRL, due at the end of the current financial year.</p> <p>.</p>	<p>AE and PD recommended that the Group should focus on live-editing of draft text today, so as to finalise, as far as possible, the content of the report during this meeting.</p>	<p>It was agreed that amendments and additions to the draft text would be made by live-edit during the meeting. MT</p> <p>It was also agreed that the resulting revised version of the draft papers would be circulated to the Group as soon as possible following the meeting. MT/PD/JM</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>During this meeting</p> <p>ASAP</p>
4.1 Draft Outline Report <i>Paper 003</i>	Members considered the draft format and outline of the annual report, presented in Paper M6/003.	Amendments and additions were made to the draft paper and executed by live-edit during the meeting.	<p>Amendments were agreed and the requirements for additional text noted and recorded in the edited paper.</p> <p>It was agreed that AE will lead on completion of the ‘Introduction’, ‘Conclusions’ and ‘Implications of the Forward Work Programme’ sections of the report. AE</p>	Open (Edited document refers)	By 11th March

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
4.2 2010 Offshore Retrieval Implications <i>Papers 004 and 005</i>	Members considered the draft content of Paper M6/004, prepared by TA, in conjunction with the comments provided by AT in Paper M6/005.	Amendments and additions were made to TA's paper and executed by live-edit during the meeting. The points raised in AT's paper were considered and noted, where applicable.	Actions were agreed and the requirements for additional text noted and recorded in the edited paper. It was agreed that TA will lead on completion of Section 2.2 of the report, in respect of the Implications of the 2010 Retrieval Operation. TA	Open (Edited document refers)	By 11th March
4.3 Beach Monitoring <i>Paper 006</i>	Members considered and discussed the draft content of Paper M6/006, prepared by AT.	Amendments and additions were made to TA's paper and executed by live-edit during the meeting.	Actions were agreed and the requirements for additional text noted and recorded in the edited paper. It was agreed that AT + MS will lead on completion of Section 2.3 of the report, in respect of the analysis of the results of the 2010 Beach Surveys. AT + MS	Open (Edited document refers)	By 11th March
5 Offshore Retrieval Work Programme	This was considered in conjunction with the text in the draft annual report. DSRL sought further views and recommendations from the Members on the direction of the retrieval work programme for 2011.	Following extensive discussion and further consideration, the Group's recommendation was recorded in the draft annual report. It was also agreed that the recommended 'default	Recommendations were agreed and recorded in the edited paper.	Open (Edited document refers)	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
5 Offshore Retrieval Work Programme (continued)		<p>position' would remain as that agreed and recorded at the PRAG(D) January meeting, reiterated below:</p> <p><i>It was agreed that the Group would recommend two specific areas of operation for the 2011 programme. These were identified as:</i></p> <p><i>i) An area up to the Northeast, as near as it is possible to get to the boundary. 2 Hectares to be monitored once and then the data reviewed;</i></p> <p><i>ii) The remaining 18 hectares to include a re-survey of the area of a 30^m overlap at the top Northeast corner and continue along a straight line along the shore to the Northeast, as far as the equipment can go, for a maximum of 14 hectares, with the provision that the remainder of at least 4 hectares is a re-coverage within that 14 hectares.</i></p>			
6 Future PRAG Work Programme	The Group's immediate work programme had been fully considered under items 4 and 5.	The outstanding areas of work were summarised during discussion of the further draft text required to	Recommendations were agreed and recorded in the edited paper. All , as specified.	Open (Edited document refers)	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
6 Future PRAG Work Programme <i>(continued)</i>		complete the annual report by the due deadline.	The Members were requested to provide their revised draft text sections by 11/3/11 . The Tec Sec would collate the sections provided to produce a complete draft report as soon as possible thereafter. All Members/Tec Sec	Open	By 11 March
7 Future Meetings	The Acting Chairman asked JG if he wished to comment on this item.	JG stated that, in his opinion, it would be unwise to dispense with the very useful expertise provided by the Group at this stage of the retrieval operation. He informed the Members that he therefore intended to recommend to the SEPA CEO that PRAG(D) remain in existence for another year, perhaps convening a further two meetings during that time, in order to provide continuing advice to SEPA.	JG's comments were noted by the Members. It was proposed that the Members be informed of any requirement for future meetings as soon as possible. SEPA/JG	Open	ASAP
8 Any Other Business 8.1 Expenses	Professor Elliott asked the Members to be aware that any outstanding claims for reimbursement of expenses should be submitted as soon as possible for processing during SEPA's current financial year.		Members were asked to submit any outstanding claims for reimbursement to JM as quickly as possible. All + JM	Open	ASAP

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>8.2 DSRL Invitation to Witness Off-shore Operation</p>	<p>PC said that, once this season's offshore operation is deployed, it might be interesting for the Members of the Group to witness the retrieval operation first hand from the barge, if this could be arranged. PC informed the Members that although the event would be weather-dependent, it should be possible to do the run to Scrabster and back in one day.</p> <p>He advised the meeting that, when a contract is in place for the 2011 work, he may be able to offer a formal invitation to the Members and organise a date sometime in June. PC said that once DSRL knows it is going to deploy and gets stable operations, it should be possible to give a couple of weeks' notice for the visit.</p>	<p>The Acting Chairman thanked PC for his suggestion and indicated that the Members would welcome the opportunity to see the ROV operation first hand.</p>			
<p>8.3 Provisional Date for further Meeting</p>	<p>In view of JG's earlier comment (item 7) AE asked the Group to consider the timescale for a future meeting.</p>	<p>The Tec Sec suggested that a provisional date be should be proposed, pending advice from SEPA on the continuation of PRAG's work.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the Group would inform JM of their availability to attend a meeting, if required, on the following dates: 9th, 10th or 11th November 2011. All</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>By 11 March</p>
<p>9 Minutes</p>	<p>AE asked the Group to consider Papers M6/001 and M6/002.</p>				
<p>9.1 Record of Previous Meeting Paper 001</p>	<p>The Acting Chair requested that the draft Summary of Discussion and Record of Recommendations and Actions from the meeting held on 14th January 2011 be considered by the Group outwith this</p>	<p>Due to time constraints today and the late circulation of papers for this meeting, it was agreed that the summary note from the</p>	<p>The Group agreed to provide comments on, or confirm their acceptance of, the draft Minute of the 5th PRAG meeting to JM as</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>By 11 March</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
9.1 Record of Previous Meeting <i>Paper 001</i> (continued)	meeting. (Paper M6/001)	previous meeting would be considered by circulation.	soon as possible. All Comments or amendments to be considered by the Acting Chair and Tec Sec prior to final acceptance. AE + PD Once agreed, JM to arrange for publication of the January Minute on the SEPA website. JM	Open Open	ASAP ASAP
9.2 Actions Arising <i>Paper 002</i>	Due to the late hour, the Tec Sec asked the Group to consider the list of actions arising or outstanding from the previous meetings outwith this meeting. (Paper M6/002)	It was agreed that the outstanding action points would be considered by circulation.	The Group agreed to provide comments on, or confirm their acceptance of, the Actions Arising from the 5 th PRAG meeting to JM as soon as possible. All Once comments are received from the Members, any actions remaining as outstanding or deferred from previous meetings will be recorded as an appendix to this record. Tec Sec & JM	Open Open	For the next meeting For the next meeting

10 Acting Chairman's Closing Summary	<p>The Acting Chairman thanked those present for their contributions. On behalf of the Members, he expressed his appreciation of the tabled presentation from DSRL and asked BT to convey his thanks to Jason Bonniface at DSRL for his prompt work in providing revised images to the Group, as requested and arising during today's meeting, for the Members' immediate consideration.</p> <p>AE closed the meeting and advised that, if the Group is asked to continue with its work, the next meeting would be held on the ROV barge in June, or in Glasgow between 9-11 November 2011.</p>				
-------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	--	--	--

Acronyms

DSG
DSRL
FY

HPA
NDA
PRAG(D)
RCLR
ROV
SG
SEPA

Dounreay Stakeholders Group
Dounreay Site Restoration Limited
(SEPA) Financial Year: 1st April 2010 to 31st March 2011
Health Protection Agency
Nuclear Decommissioning Authority
Particles Retrieval Advisory Group (Dounreay)
Radioactive Contaminated Land Regulations
Remotely Operated Vehicle
(The) Scottish Government
Scottish Environment Protection Agency