

PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY)

SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION and RECORD OF RECOMMENDATIONS and ACTIONS

7th MEETING OF THE PARTICLES RETRIEVAL ADVISORY GROUP (DOUNREAY) – 12th December 2011

Members Present:

Prof Alex Elliott (Member) – **AE (Acting Chairman)**
 Prof Tim Atkinson (Member) - **TA**
 Dr George Hunter (Member) - **GH**
 Prof Marian Scott (Member) - **MS**
 Dr Andrew Tyler (Member) - **AT**
 Dr Paul Dale (Technical Secretary) - **PD**

In Attendance:

Mr Phil Cartwright (Observer, DSRL) - **PC**
 Mr Stuart Chalmers (Observer (nominated alternate), NDA) - **SC**
 Mr Hugh Fearn (Observer, SEPA) - **HF**
 Mr Jim Gemmill (Observer, SEPA) - **JG**
 Mr Bill Thomson (Observer, DSRL) - **BT**
 Mr Mark Toner (Observer, SEPA) - **MT**

Mrs June Moore (Administration) - **JM**

Apologies:

Ms Joanne Brown (Observer, HPA) - **JB**
 Mr Stuart Hudson (Observer, SG) - **SH**
 Observer, DSG

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
1 Acting Chairman's Introduction	<p>The Acting Chairman welcomed all present to the 7th PRAG meeting.</p> <p>AE requested a formal record of welcome to Dr George Hunter, who has been appointed as a Member of the Group to provide expertise on the radiological protection framework. Dr Hunter joined the Group during its visit to observe the offshore retrieval work in June and also attended the PRAG Workshop, held in August this year.</p>	<p>The Acting Chairman noted and accepted apologies from Joanne Brown (HPA) and the SG.</p> <p>AE noted that the main purpose of today's meeting was to establish a clear idea for DSRL of PRAG's recommendations for the area and scope of the 2012 retrieval operation.</p>			

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>1 Acting Chairman's Introduction <i>(continued)</i></p>	<p>The Acting Chairman also invited the meeting to welcome back June Moore, who has now returned as administrative support to the Group after a period of absence due to illness.</p> <p>AE advised the meeting that the Group's deliberations at the informal Workshop, held in August to consider early data from the detection and retrieval operation, would also be taken into consideration during today's discussion.</p>				
<p>2 Minutes of Last Meeting and Actions Arising</p>	<p>PD reported that preparation of a Note of the Workshop on 8 August and the Outstanding Actions emanating from that discussion had been delayed due to other, urgent SEPA work priorities for MT and PD, and to JM's absence.</p>	<p>PD suggested that, if deemed appropriate, these documents could be considered by circulation, outwith this meeting.</p>	<p>MT to produce a note of the Workshop, as soon as possible.</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>
<p>3 Surveys Update – Beaches 3.1 Sandside Beach</p>	<p>The Acting Chair invited DSRL to provide information on recent onshore surveys.</p> <p>BT gave a presentation on the onshore monitoring operations from Oct 2010 to November 2011 and confirmed the number and location of all particles detected and retrieved on Sandside beach during the relevant period.</p> <p>BT advised the Group that DSRL believes that most of the particles being retrieved are 'new' finds and suggested that this could be due to particles now being detected in low water areas and/or changes in the monitoring process.</p>	<p>The Group noted that a full year of continuous monitoring data is now available for consideration. Members expressed their appreciation of DSRL's ability to undertake the continuous surveys and stressed the value of this comprehensive data.</p> <p>It was noted that the report from the Sandside Independent Assessors' Panel is expected shortly. PC anticipated that the report would include terms of agreement on access for future beach monitoring.</p>	<p>A copy of the statement by SEPA's North Region Board pertaining to the issue of "returning the seabed to a pristine condition" was requested. Tec Sec/AE/TA</p> <p>It was agreed that a more considered analysis of the continuous survey data would be required from MS and AT before the Group could make any recommendations to amend the current monitoring regime. MS & AT</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p> <p>ASAP</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>3.1 Sandside Beach (continued)</p> <p>3.2 Dounreay Foreshore</p> <p>3.3 Dunnet Beach</p> <p>3.4 Other Beaches</p>	<p>BT informed the meeting that the majority of the particles found were in the <i>minor</i> category, the detection of which could be attributable to increased effectiveness of the monitoring equipment.</p> <p>PC advised that, on currently agreed funding, DSRL planned to continue with the enhanced monitoring until the end of March 2012.</p> <p>PD informed the meeting that SEPA is progressing with a new authorisation for DSRL which may incorporate a different monitoring regime.</p> <p>A report on the survey results for the Dounreay foreshore and for all other beaches was presented.</p> <p>DSRL concluded the presentation by raising the matter of “Future Requirements”, seeking the Group’s recommendations relating to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion Criteria • Reduction in Surveys/Frequency/Coverage • Timescales 	<p>The meeting discussed the definition of ‘new’ particles. It was noted that there is very little sand on the lower part of the beach, possibly due to the effects of high north-westerly winds across the beach during October.</p> <p>JG updated the Group on SEPA’s current considerations and the enhanced monitoring options were noted and discussed.</p> <p>The Acting Chairman advised that these issues would be addressed in the Group’s annual report.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the time delay between statutory and enhanced monitoring was important in terms of interpreting the data. MS & AT (to address this issue in the annual report).</p> <p>DSRL agreed to produce data separating statutory monitoring particle finds from enhanced monitoring retrievals. DSRL</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>Within timeframe for annual report</p> <p>ASAP</p>
<p>4 Offshore Retrieval Work Programme</p>	<p>AE invited DSRL to provide an update to the meeting on the programme of work during 2011. BT gave a presentation detailing the results of the offshore retrieval operation, including a breakdown of activity and location of particles recovered. DSRL advised that the data</p>	<p>The Group noted the number and designation of particles located and retrieved in relation to the main plume and also outwith the current FEPA zone. PD said that SEPA</p>	<p>It was agreed that further data will be provided on the re-classification of particle activity after Laboratory processing. DSRL</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>4 Offshore Retrieval Work Programme (continued)</p>	<p>would be subject to further analysis to provide the basis of the programme of work for 2012, if funding is provided for a further retrieval operation season. More considered and detailed analyses would be distributed to the Group as soon as they are available.</p>	<p>will, in time, have to assess under RCLR whether there may be particles located outside the FEPA FE zone. Following discussion, the Group recommended that it may be advisable to consider a further survey beyond the FE zone, if the coverage could be included in the programme of work for 2012.</p>	<p>Agreed that PC will check whether a <i>significant</i> particle has yet been detected outside the FE zone. PC</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>
	<p>PC advised the Group that it may be difficult to obtain support to work outside the FEPA exclusion zone and that the co-operation of local fishermen will be required.</p>	<p>The Group noted that the divided sectional diagram had been prepared as a survey planning tool and PC advised Members that, if operational results differ from those anticipated, he would welcome their advice (on a real-time, reactive basis) so as to adjust the search areas and follow the plume. AE recommended that this be done <i>via</i> PRAG email route circulation, to enable Members to give their immediate response to the implications of results during 'live' operation time.</p>	<p>DSRL agreed to provide further information about <i>significant</i> particles retrieved from outwith the main plume. DSRL</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>
	<p>Extensive discussion ensued regarding the delineation and shape of the plume, and where the Group considers the greatest number of <i>significant</i> particles may lie. The meeting also discussed the implications the retrieval programme might have on the potential numbers of fragments being transported onshore.</p>	<p>The Group noted that the divided sectional diagram had been prepared as a survey planning tool and PC advised Members that, if operational results differ from those anticipated, he would welcome their advice (on a real-time, reactive basis) so as to adjust the search areas and follow the plume. AE recommended that this be done <i>via</i> PRAG email route circulation, to enable Members to give their immediate response to the implications of results during 'live' operation time.</p>	<p>The Group agreed to consider and prioritise its recommended search area to enable DSRL to finalise a planning diagram. All Members</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>By next meeting</p>
	<p>The mapped sections for the operation were considered and the Group debated the most effective areas to be targeted for survey, in order to retrieve an optimum number of <i>significant</i> and <i>relevant</i> particles within the 2012 programme timeframe and budget constraints.</p>	<p>Following discussion, Members recommended amendments to the survey areas provisionally outlined on the maps.</p>	<p>The Group also agreed to provide DSRL with an order of priority for recommended search areas which may be sacrificed, should it become necessary to reduce the overall ROV survey area schedule due to adverse weather or other potential constraints. All Members</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>During retrieval operation</p>
<p>The need to identify designated areas which may be sacrificed, should it prove impossible for DSRL to survey all of the proposed survey zones, was debated. The value of continuation of monitoring at Sentry Boxes was also discussed.</p>		<p>PC agreed that Jason would adjust the proposed survey map delineations. DSRL</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>	

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>5 SSE Consultation on Undersea Cable from Orkney to Caithness</p>	<p>The Acting Chairman invited the meeting to consider Papers 30 and 31; the SHETL Consultation Document and Project Maps for the Orkney Caithness Connection. A discussion ensued on the proposed routes of the SSE undersea cable. The Group was asked to consider whether it was concerned by a route which would bring the cable in through the Crosskirk area and HF enquired, should the cable be located through the DPAG main plume, if SSE had intimated whether it would be prepared to undertake any future monitoring of this area.</p>	<p>After the Members had considered the consultation document and relevant maps, a recommended response to SEPA's request for PRAG's comments was outlined.</p> <p>During the Group's deliberations, it was noted by the Group that SEPA will be concerned with what future monitoring will be required, once a FEPA licence is sought by SSE.</p>	<p>Following the Group's deliberations, it was agreed that the Acting Chairman and Technical Secretary would produce a draft letter of response and circulate it (electronically) to Members for their approval, before submitting a final Group response to SSE via SEPA. AE + PD</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p>
<p>6 Preparation of Group's Report to SEPA</p>	<p>The content of the various sections of the Group's annual report to SEPA and DSRL were discussed.</p> <p>The Group considered the results of the 2011 offshore survey and the potential implications for future retrieval work.</p> <p>The beach monitoring results were discussed and, at DSRL's request, frequency of future monitoring regimes considered in light of the suggestion that the impact of offshore retrieval work could, potentially, result in a reduction of particle re-population of the beaches.</p> <p>The Acting Chairman advised the meeting that the Group's evaluation of all relevant issues would be collated and presented in its 2011-12 annual report, due at the end of the current FY.</p>	<p>It was recommended that the future monitoring of beaches be discussed again at the next meeting, once MS and AT had had an opportunity to evaluate more 'refined' data.</p> <p>It was noted that any potential implications of offshore retrieval of particles on future beach monitoring regimes will be addressed in the annual report.</p> <p>It was recommended that the draft material required from individual Members of the Group for the various sections of the annual report be prepared for discussion at the next meeting.</p>	<p>Following assessment of initial data available, it was agreed that DSRL would provide the further data requested to MS and AT, by second week of January. PC</p> <p>It was agreed that MS and AT would consider the 2011 data and produce outline analyses for consideration at the next meeting. MS & AT</p> <p>The Group agreed that draft text and/or outline analyses for inclusion in the PRAG(D) 2011-12 annual report will be considered at the next meeting. All Members</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>By 9 Jan</p> <p>For next meeting</p> <p>For next meeting</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>7 Future PRAG Work Programme</p>	<p>AE advised the meeting that the Group's immediate work should be concentrated on preparation of its annual report, due on 1st April 2012.</p> <p>AE stated that any future work to be undertaken by this Group would be determined by SEPA and DSRL; Members' current contracts expire at the end of April next year.</p>	<p>It was noted that work on all sections of the annual report should be undertaken as discussed and agreed during this meeting.</p> <p>It was recommended that any consideration of the continuation and future work of PRAG(D) be deferred until the next meeting.</p>	<p>It was agreed that draft text for the report would be submitted to the Acting Chairman and Technical Secretary, for collation as soon as possible. All Members/AE & PD</p> <p>Deferred. SEPA & DSRL</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p> <p>At next meeting</p>
<p>8 Any Other Business</p>	<p>AE invited the meeting to present any other items of competent business.</p> <p>PC raised the matter of Members' expenses and requested prompt submission of all outstanding claims to facilitate the processing of invoices through the DSRL finance system before the end of the current calendar year.</p>		<p>The Members agreed to submit their expense claims to JM as soon as possible. Members & JM</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>Before end of Dec 2011</p>
<p>9 Acting Chairman's Closing Summary</p>	<p>The Acting Chairman asked the Group to consult their diaries to agree a date, preferably sometime during February 2012, for the next meeting. Following discussion, a mutually convenient date was identified.</p>	<p>The Group noted that the next meeting would be held on 2nd February 2012.</p> <p>The relevant Members were also requested by AE to provisionally reserve 3rd Feb in their diaries for a meeting of the new Expert Group providing advice to SEPA on radioactive contamination in another location.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the next PRAG(D) meeting would be held on Thursday, 2nd February 2012. JM to arrange suitable venue and confirm to Group. JM</p> <p>PD, MT (and relevant Members) to note provisional date of 3rd Feb for meeting of new group. PD & MT</p>	<p>Open</p> <p>Open</p>	<p>ASAP</p> <p>N/A</p>

Agenda Item	Summary of Discussion	Recommendation	Action	Status	Target Date
<p>9 Acting Chairman's Closing Summary (continued)</p>	<p>The Technical Secretary requested that all papers and draft material for the annual report should be provided well in advance of the next meeting, to allow sufficient time for consideration and content review by the Group, and the presentation of Members' comments on draft text during the February meeting.</p> <p>The Acting Chairman thanked those present for their contributions to the meeting and their work outwith the meeting in producing the various presentations, reports and comments considered by the Group today.</p>	<p>It was recommended that, if possible, all data, papers and draft text for inclusion in the annual report should be submitted to the Tec Sec by 17th January 2012.</p>	<p>It was agreed that the deadline for receipt of all papers for consideration at the next meeting will be Tuesday, 17th January 2012.</p> <p>All</p>	<p>Open</p>	<p>By 17/1/2012</p>

Acronyms

DSG	Dounreay Stakeholders Group
DSRL	Dounreay Site Restoration Limited
FE	FEPA designated Fishing Exclusion Zone
FEPA	Food & Environment Protection Agency
FY	(SEPA) Financial Year: 1 st April 2010 to 31 st March 2011
HPA	Health Protection Agency
NDA	Nuclear Decommissioning Authority
PRAG(D)	Particles Retrieval Advisory Group (Dounreay)
RCLR	Radioactive Contaminated Land Regulations
ROV	Remotely Operated Vehicle
SSE	Scottish & Southern Energy
SG	(The) Scottish Government
SHETL	Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission Limited
SEPA	Scottish Environment Protection Agency