

**SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY**

**Minutes of Dalgety Bay Forum Meeting**

**Held on Monday 11<sup>th</sup> March 2013**

**Brook North Queensferry Hotel**

**Present**

Nick Atkins (NA), Morton Fraser (accompanying DIO)  
 John Burton (JB), HPA  
 Helen Eadie MSP (HE), Member of Scottish Parliament  
 Prof. Alex Elliot (AE), COMARE  
 Becky Gait (BG), NHS Fife  
 Fiona Grant (FG), Morton Fraser (accompanying DIO)  
 Andrew Howard (AH), Moray Estates  
 Will Munro (WM), FSA in Scotland  
 Iain Robertson (IR), DIO  
 Linda Turner (LT), Fife Council  
 Jackie Hyland (JH), NHS Fife  
 Cllr Lesley Laird (LL), Fife Council  
 Rory McLeod (RM), Moray Estates  
 Martin Macdonald (MM), Scottish Government  
 Colin McPhail (CMcP), DB&HCC  
 Annette Stuart (AS), Scottish Government  
 Cllr Gavin Yates (GY), Fife Council  
 Matt Thomas, (MTh) Dalgety Bay Sailing Club  
 John Sim (JS), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club  
 Jim Gemmill (JG), SEPA  
 Paul Dale (PD), SEPA  
 Gillian Sinclair (GS), SEPA  
 Debbie Storm (DS), SEPA  
 Mark Toner (MT), SEPA

**Apologies**

Donald Grant (DG), Fife Council  
 David Brack (DB), DIO  
 Ron Brown (RB), MOD/DSTL  
 Simon Cuthbert-Kerr (SCK), Scottish Government  
 Mark Hill, (MH), DIO  
 Janice Milne (JM), Chairperson, SEPA

**Non attendance:**

Donald Adrain (DA), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club  
 David Burnett (DBur), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club  
 Richard Higgins (RH), Dalgety Bay Sailing Club

<b>Summary of actions from meeting – 11<sup>th</sup> March 2013</b>		
<b>Action 2013-03-01</b>	<b>Action No: 2013-03-01:</b> Forum Members to email GS with any amendments to the previous minutes of 5 <sup>th</sup> December 2013.	<b>All by 15/03/2013</b>
<b>Action 2013-03-02</b>	<b>Action No: 2013-03-02:</b> SEPA to arrange appropriate date and venue for the next Forum Meeting.	<b>SEPA, before end May</b>

<b>1.0</b>	<b>Welcome and Apologies</b>	<b>Actions</b>
<b>1.1</b>	JG welcomed those present to the meeting. He advised that he would chair the meeting in the absence of JM. He welcomed new representatives from Moray Estates, Dalgety Bay Sailing Club, Scottish Government, NHS Fife, COMARE and Morton Fraser Solicitors to the meeting. Round table introductions were made. JG also apologised for the late start which was due to inclement weather conditions.	
<b>1.2</b>	Formal apologies from DA, DB, RB, SCK, MH and JM were recorded.	
<b>1.3</b>	Those not in attendance are noted above.	
<b>2.0</b>	<b>Minutes of previous meeting 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012</b>	
<b>2.1 ACTION</b>	<b>ACTION No 2013-03-01</b> AE requested a change to the wording of Paragraph 4 of the previous minute. JG asked AE to email amendments direct to GS.	<b>AE/GS 15/03/2013</b>

<b>Actions arising from meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012</b>		
<b>Action 2012-12-01</b>	<b>Complete</b> – Comments on previous minutes (10th September 2012) to be emailed to GS by the end of this week.	<i>All by 7/12/12</i> <b>COMPLETE</b>
<b>Action 2012-12-02</b>	<b>Complete</b> – SEPA contact COMARE to invite them to a meeting of Form Members to be held early in 2013.	<i>SEPA</i> <b>COMPLETE</b>
<b>Action 2012-12-03</b>	<b>Complete</b> – CMcP asked that “Communications” be added to the agenda of the next meeting.	<i>SEPA</i> <b>COMPLETE</b>

## SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

<b>3.0</b>	<b>Communications</b>	
<b>3.1</b>	CMcP asked that Communications remain as a standing item on the Agenda of future meetings. This would ensure that updates from SEPA, DIO and the Expert Group are fed back to the Forum.	
<b>3.2</b>	This was agreed by the Forum	
<b>4.0</b>	<b>UPDATE</b>	
<b>4.1</b>	<b>SEPA</b>	
<b>4.1.1</b>	PD advised that the habits survey fieldwork was now complete and the findings are being analysed and a report prepared. The data will also be used for the Risk Assessment. The results of the investigation work will also play an important part in the Risk Assessment.	
<b>4.1.2</b>	The Risk Assessment Report will be available in May 2013. GY asked if this was on target for May. PD advised that this would depend on information from the investigation work being available from DIO.	
<b>4.1.3</b>	SEPA is also continuing to review the monitoring work carried out by the DIO contractor (AMEC) to determine if the current restrictions in place at Dalgety Bay are appropriate.	
<b>4.1.4</b>	NA asked if the habits survey covered the use of the whole of the beach. PD advised that SEPA are following EC recommendations on habits surveys and following the normal processes for routine habits surveys around Nuclear Licensed Sites to determine the risks posed to individuals using the beach.	
<b>4.1.5</b>	AH asked what determines the allocation of responsibility. JG agreed to speak with members from Moray Estates outwith the meeting to provide them with background information and a more detailed answer to AH's question.	
<b>4.2</b>	<b>MoD</b>	
<b>4.2.1</b>	IR advised that the signs are now in place, including internal ones at the Sailing Club. Analytical data from SEPA will now have to be incorporated into the revised investigation report. Beach monitoring is ongoing. Coastal Processes Report has been issued to the Forum.	
<b>4.2.2</b>	IR stated that investigation work is now complete and the report will be handed to SEPA on Thursday 14 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. DIO await SEPA's comments on the reports. JG noted that SEPA will comment on the report once reviewed. CMcP asked when the report would be released to Forum members given that it is already behind time. SEPA advised that it would be timely, however, they would be unable to advise a formal date for issue to the Forum, as they are still awaiting sight of the report from DIO. IR stated that the reason the report was behind schedule was due to the delay to the start of the works resulting from access issues, which was out of DIO control. He went on to acknowledge the outcome of the investigation work has delivered a good product.	
<b>4.2.3</b>	NA reiterated that the release of the report will be through and by SEPA.	
<b>4.2.4</b>	JH referred to the content of the report and stated that the content should give a clear conclusion and provide information on how the public will be	

## SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

	protected. Following discussion it was noted that the report is a factual information document of the findings of the investigation work and does not layout future events. SEPA stated that along with the release of the report it could provide a contextual update on the SEPA Website relating to the report.	
4.2.5	LL stated that there must be text in the report accompanying the facts which informs the people of Dalgety Bay what needs to be done and what the next steps will be.	
4.2.6	JG said he would discuss with DIO the possibility of inserting a "Foreword" into the report with clear explanations of the content.	
4.2.7	SEPA stated that it would be considering advice from the Dalgety Bay Particles Advisory Group (DBPAG) on the content of the report.	
4.3	<b>Scottish Government</b>	
4.3.1	MM stated that COMARE's advice has been welcomed by Scottish Ministers. This was followed by a meeting between The Minister for Public Health (Michael Matheson MSP) and HE which went well.	
4.3.2	Scottish Government noted the investigation work which had taken place and will welcome remediation asap.	
4.4	<b>Fife Council</b>	
4.4.1	LT advised that signs remain in place on the Beach and there has been no new calls received under the FEPA Order.	
4.4.2	LL stated that the Council was looking forward to the pending reports and to a conclusion of the issue.	
4.5	<b>FSA in Scotland</b>	
4.5.1	No radioactive particles have been found during the shellfish monitoring which started in February 2012. The sampling has lead to a depletion of the various shellfish populations, and when considered with data over the past 12 months it is not appropriate to continue this intensive monitoring programme. Instead, surface monitoring will be undertaken over mussel and winkle beds. The FSA website will soon feature a web-story to provide an update to the public.	
4.5.2	PD noted the results of the previous 12 months monitoring and advised that the mussel beds are out with the high-activity area. The data is useful in suggesting that there is not an offshore cache of particles feeding the beach.	
4.6	<b>HPA</b>	
4.6.1	JB advised that the HPA still continues to support SEPA and SG. HPA will continue discussions with SEPA and Stirling University regarding potential skin doses.	
4.7	<b>NHS Fife</b>	
4.7.1	JH reiterated (referring to Para 4.2.4 above) that when reports are being written the contents must be carefully considered.	
4.7.2	NHS Fife also asked if it would be possible for them to link their website to reports on the SEPA website as is done with the HPA. SEPA were in agreement.	

## SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY

4.7.3	DS asked for pre-notification of press releases from all members, as this helps SEPA allocate resource to likely press interest.	
4.8 4.8.1  4.8.2	<p><b>Sailing Club</b></p> <p>JS stated that the club is in the process of contacting members to ask them to renew their membership. This is the first time renewal has been approached in this way. The club is running regattas although not at the same level of attendance as previous years due to people going elsewhere for these events.</p> <p>There are some maintenance issues which need to be addressed including the ongoing erosion of the slipway and SEPA's advice on what work can be carried out on this would be welcome. SEPA agreed to provide the necessary radiological advice to assist in this matter. NA enquired as to what advice SEPA had provided the Sailing Club, to which JS responded that they were not to dig or undertake any works. PD confirmed that this advice was for radiological safety, where SEPA would provide support for maintenance, for example digging a cable in the grounds of the club.</p>	
4.9 4.9.1  4.9.2	<p><b>Dalgety Bay and Hillend Community Council</b></p> <p>CMcP advised that SEPA would be attending the Dalgety Bay and Hillend Community Council meeting that evening. He has prepared a paper to the Institute of Civil Engineering of which an abstract has been accepted for their conference in Edinburgh. He said MoD would need to see this – IR stated that he would prefer for SEPA to be the main point of contact.</p> <p>CMcP stated that the Community Council is still obtaining information from people relevant to activities undertaken at Dalgety Bay. This information is being passed to SEPA and DIO. Information gathering will continue until May 2013 and people who have come forward are available for interview. JG noted that SEPA would accept any information, even if it was after the timetable of works.</p>	
4.10	<p><b>Moray Estates</b></p> <p>Nothing to report.</p>	
5.0 5.1  5.2  5.3  5.4	<p><b>COMARE</b></p> <p>JG welcomed Professor Alex Elliot (AE) to the Forum meeting. He was in attendance at the request of members of the Forum as a result of the COMARE report which was obtained by a journalist from SEPA under an FOI enquiry.</p> <p>AE provided the Forum with the history of COMARE and COMARE's involvement at Dalgety Bay.</p> <p>AE explained that a number of statistical analyses had been performed at Dalgety Bay and some of these showed a significant result. COMARE was undertaking further work in the area when the report was requested under FOI. AE advised that he spoke to the journalist providing an explanation of the results but unfortunately there is no control of the press and he stated that what was reported in the newspapers does not reflect what is contained in the report.</p> <p>As a result COMARE spoke to the Scottish Government and Sir Harry Burns, CMO and agreed that a further report would be issued. This was published on 2<sup>nd</sup> January 2013. Furthermore COMARE will issue a final</p>	

**SCOTTISH ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION AGENCY**

5.5	<p>report once DIO and SEPA reports are complete and this will go to the Scottish Government.</p> <p>AE also stated that he would be happy to attend future Forum meeting once the final report is released.</p>	
6.0	<b>Future Actions</b>	
<p>6.1</p> <p><b>ACTION</b></p> <p>6.2</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Meeting of the Dalgety Bay and Hillend Community Council being held this evening and SEPA will be in attendance.</li> <li>• The next meeting of the “Expert Group” will be held after SEPA receive the reports of the result of the intrusive investigation from DIO.</li> <li>• The next Forum meeting will be held after the DIO and consequently SEPA’s report has been issued and is anticipated at the end of May.</li> </ul> <p>The Forum noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SEPA is undertaking habits survey field work.</li> <li>• DIO Coastal Process Report has been issued.</li> <li>• SEPA is awaiting receipt of the report of the physical investigation work from DIO.</li> <li>• Appropriate person to be identified by SEPA.</li> <li>• Risk Assessment work being undertaken by SEPA.</li> <li>• SEPA’s Risk Assessment report will be issued after the DIO report has been received and analysed.</li> </ul>	<b>SEPA</b>
7.0	<b>Date of Next Meeting</b>	
7.1	<p>It was agreed by the Forum that the next meeting will be held once DIO report and SEPA’s Risk Assessment report has been issued which is anticipated to be the end of May.</p>	
	<b>END</b>	